TOWARD RELIGIOUS MODERATION: Mohammed Arkoun's and Hasan Hanafi's Perspectives on Indonesian Wasatiyah Islam

Fathurrahman Muhtar

Universitas Islam Negeri Mataram
Jl. Pendidikan No.35, Mataram, Nusa Tenggara Barat. 83125,
e-mail: fathurrahmanmuhtar@uinmataram.ac.id

Abstract : This research examines the views of Mohammed Arkoun and Hasan Hanafi on Wasatiyah Islam in Indonesia. Both Muslim scholars emphasize the importance of interfaith dialogue and the wise application of religion. This research uses a literature review to collect data from the works of Arkoun, Hanafi, and other relevant sources on Islam and Wasatiyah in Indonesia. The results showed that Arkoun and Hanafi had a significant influence on Wasatiyah Islam in Indonesia. Wasatiyah Islam encourages interfaith harmony and religious diversity through dialog and inclusiveness. The research findings imply that the ideas of Arkoun and Hanafi are important for Wasatiyah Islam in Indonesia and can help develop a moderate and inclusive outlook.

Abstrak : Penelitian ini mengkaji pandangan Mohammed Arkoun dan Hasan Hanafi mengenai Islam Wasatiyah di Indonesia. Kedua sarjana Muslim ini menekankan pentingnya dialog antaragama dan penerapan agama secara bijaksana. Penelitian ini menggunakan tinjauan literatur untuk mengumpulkan data dari karya-karya Arkoun, Hanafi, dan sumber-sumber lain yang relevan tentang Islam dan Wasatiyah di Indonesia. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa Arkoun dan Hanafi memiliki pengaruh yang signifikan pada Islam Wasatiyah di Indonesia. Islam Wasatiyah mendorong harmoni antaragama dan keberagaman keagamaan melalui dialog dan inklusivitas. Temuan penelitian menyiratkan bahwa gagasan Arkoun dan Hanafi penting bagi Islam Wasatiyah di Indonesia dan dapat membantu mengembangkan pandangan yang moderat dan inklusif.

Key words : Indonesia, Islam, Wasatiyah, interfaith harmony, religious diversity

Introduction

Muslim reformers face the challenge of aligning proposed reforms with long-standing Islamic principles and customs. The acceptability or rejection of Islamic reformist thought depends on its perceived Islamic authenticity. Therefore, the "how" (methodology) is as crucial as the "what" (reforms).[1] Modern Islamic scholars, particularly Neo-Modernists, have questioned classical Islamic reasoning because it could not illuminate Islam after the door to ijtihad was opened.[2] Islamic rational criticism was influenced by medieval politics. The writings by Albert Hourani regarding figures like Afghani, Abduh, and Wajdi demonstrate how Islam became associated with 19th-century European civilization and scientific ideas, nearly fading into contemporary reasoning.[3]

In the late 20th and early 21st centuries, several thinkers attempted to create a modern, adaptable form of Islam. Figures like Fazlur Rahman, Riffat Hassan, Abdolkarim Soroush, Farid Esack, Abdul Karim Tayob, Hasan Hanafi, Nasr Hamed Abu Zayd, Abdullahi Ahmed an-Na'im, Mohamed Talbi, Abul Fadl, and others used history, anthropology, sociology, linguistics, and hermeneutics to interpret Islamic heritage.[4] According to Nasr Hamid Abu Zaid, contemporary Muslim scholars debated whether to break with traditional thought or critically engage with it. The latter option represents a wise compromise between absolute secularism and absolute traditionalism or fundamentalism.[5]

Muhammad Arkoun and Hasan Hanafi initiated critical engagement with contemporary civilization. Mohammad Arkoun, born on February 1, 1928, in Taourirt-Mimoun, Kabilia, Algeria, passed away on September 14, 2010. His "critique of Islamic reason" is widely recognized. He articulated this critique in his book "Pour la raison islamique," which was translated into Arabic as "Al-Fikr al-Arabi al-Islami." In addition to Mohammed Arkoun, Hasan Hanafi, a philosopher born in Egypt on February 13, 1935, encouraged responses to classical turas and tajdid.

Taourirt-Mimoun, Algeria, is the birthplace of Mohammed Arkoun. Prior to assuming the role of an associate professor at the Sorbonne from 1961 to 1990, he completed his studies at the University of Algiers. He earned his doctorate at the Sorbonne in 1969 and served as a professor there from 1970 to 1992. Currently, he holds the positions of Visiting Professor at the Institute of Ismaili Studies in London and Emeritus Professor

---

[1] John L. Esposito, *The Future of Islam* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2010), 94.

[2] G. F. H. and Faziur Rahman, "Islamic Methodology in History," *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 87, no. 2 (April 1967): 221, https://doi.org/10.2307/597503.

[3] Albert Hourani, *Arabic Thought in the Liberal Age 1798–1939, Arabic Thought in the Liberal Age 1798–1939* (Cambridge: Cambridge Universty Press, 1983).

[4] Hans Küng and Hans Küng, *Islam: Past, Present and Future* (Oxford: Oneworld, 2007), 525.

[5] Muhammad Shahrur, *Al-Kitab Wa Al-Qur'an* (Suriah: Ahaly Li Tauzi', 1990).

at the Sorbonne, Paris III. Additionally, he oversees the academic publication "Arabica" and serves on the Aga Khan Award for Architecture jury. His notable works include "humanisme arabe au IVe/Xe siecle" (2nd edition, Paris: J. Vrin, 1982), "Critique de la raison islamique" (Paris, 1984), "Lectures du Coran" (2nd edition, Tunis, 1991), "Rethinking Islam: Common Questions, Uncommon Answers" (Boulder, Colorado, 1993), and "La pensée arabe" (Paris: PUF, 1996).[6]

Mohammad Arkoun grew up speaking Babylonian, Arabic, and French. The Kabilian language had no writing system, and social and economic traditions had persisted for thousands of years. French served as the language of government and introduced Western values and scientific traditions through schools established by colonizers. Arabic was used for communicating religious traditions. [7]

Arkoun urges Muslims to reevaluate Islamic traditions. He attributes the failure of contemporary Islamic discourse, reliant on past intellectual traditions, to historical, ideological, and political factors that hinder its adaptation to modernity and globalization. [8] Arkoun also critiques orthodoxy and dogmatism, which combine revelation and non-revelation in Islamic thought. He disagrees with Islamic thinkers like Muhammad Iqbal, Ali Shari'ati, and Sayyid Qutb, who are bound by Islamic reasoning, a Medieval Arab mentality that must be discarded to embrace the present. Arkoun characterizes fundamentalist, integralist, and authenticist Islam as ahistorical, idealistic, unscientific, exclusive, and intolerant - a hopeless perspective.[9]

Arkoun urges Western Arab, Muslim, and non-Muslim scholars to critique the Islamic tradition, which he believes confuses Islamic reasoning and interpretation. He thought that "Islamology" would benefit from critiquing such traditions. [10] Arkoun proposed the "language-history circle of thought" to study the historical-linguistic context

---

[6] Mohamed Mahmoud Cooper Ronald L. Nettler, John, *Islam and Modernity_ Muslim Intellectuals Respond* (London: IB. Tauris & CO.Ltd, 2000).

[7] Hamidreza Fazeli, "A Critical Study of the Quran's Theory of Mythology (A Case Study on Mohammad Arkoun's Perspectives)," no. 71 (2019).

[8] Mohammed Arkoun, "Present–Day Islam Between Its Tradition and Globalization," in *Farhad Daftary (Ed.) Intellectual Traditions in Islam* (New York/ : L. B. Tauris, 2000: L. B. Tauris, 2000).

[9] Robert Deemer Lee, *Overcoming Tradition and Modernity: The Search for Islamic Authenticity* (Boulder, Colo: Westview Press, 1997), 143.

[10] Abdallah Zbir, "Situating Mohammed Arkoun: A Tribute to a Passionate Critic," *International Journal of Linguistics, Literature and Translation* 4, no. 1 (January 30, 2021): 101–8, https://doi.org/10.32996/ijllt.2021.4.1.11.

[11] Humaira Ahmad, "Mapping Neo-Modern and Postmodern Qur'ânic Reformist Discourse in the Intellectual Legacy of Fazlur Rahman and Mohammed Arkoun," *Religions* 14, no. 5 (May 1, 2023): 595, https://doi.org/10.3390/rel14050595.

[12] Olivier Roy, *The Failure of Political Islam* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1994), 66.

of Islamic texts and the historical evolution of Islam to comprehend Islamic thought and its potential for modernization.[11] Mohammed Arkoun stated, "The debate with the colonizing West transforms religious language into ideological language, in other words, mythical goals into actual historical goals." [12]

The Islamic revolutionary and social justice movements, particularly those influenced by Sayyid Qutb, had a significant impact on Hasan Hanafi, who was born in Cairo on February 13, 1935. He contemplated, reformed, and authored numerous articles. After Egypt's 1967 defeat by Israel, his focus shifted towards nationalism. Hanafi taught at Cairo University and other universities, including in the United States. For Hanafi, the new must build upon the old as he reinterpreted religious texts for modern times, with modernity and authenticity as his goals. The religious text served as the medium, and the objective was to contribute to the development of reality by resolving issues, removing obstacles, and opening doors through renewal (tajdid). [13]

Hasan Hanafi advocated complete liberation from the influence of Western traditions. He aimed to establish a "science of Occidentalism" that encourages criticism of the West and its cultural impact. [14] His goal was to construct a political tradition and raise awareness of cultural identity by basing it on cultural and rational "Islamization." [15] Hassan Hanafi viewed Islamic fundamentalism as a historical response to a particular situation, and for him, political Islam was not an option but the only refuge available [16].

Some articles discussing the thoughts of Mohammed Arkoun and Hasan Hanafi include the following: Felsenthal, I., & Agbaria, A. (2023). "How to Read the Quran in Religious Islamic Education: What Educators Can Learn from the Work of Mohammed Arkoun." In their research, they concluded that Mohammad Arkoun offers hermeneutic techniques for reading the Quran that can be beneficial in religious education, fostering independent thinking and awareness of life's wonders. [17]

Hendri, N. (2022). "Religion Between Turats and Modernity; Reflections of Applied Islamology, according to Mohammed Arkoun." Applied Islamology employs historical

---

[13] Hasan Hanafi, *Turas Wa Tajdid (Qohiroh: An-Nasr Muasasah Hindawi, 2017), 15* (Qohiroh: An-Nasr Muasasah Hindawi, 2017), 15.

[14] Matem M. Al-Janabi, "The Ideology of Islamic Cultural Reformation (by the Example of Hassan Hanafi)," *Asian and Africa Today*, 2020.

[15] Mohamed Haddad, "Postscript: When Islam Awakens: Problematizing the Idea of Reformation (Islah) by Mohamed Arkoun," in *Muslim Reformism - A Critical History: Is Islamic Religious Reform Possible?*, ed. Mohamed Haddad (Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2020), 157–68, https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-36774-9_7.

[16] Matem M. Al-Janabi, "The Ideology of Islamic Cultural Reformation (by the Example of Hassan Hanafi)."

[17] Iddo Felsenthal and Ayman Agbaria, "How to Read the Quran in Religious Islamic Education: What Educators Can Learn from the Work of Mohammed Arkoun," *Religions* 14, no. 1 (January 16, 2023): 129, https://doi.org/10.3390/rel14010129.

criticism and hermeneutics to interpret the Quran. Arkoun believes that a new approach is necessary to free Islamic thought from outdated systems, closures, and myths in order to better understand the Quran. Arkoun proposes a combination of Islamic thought, which is religious and imaginative, with modern Western thought, which is rational and critical.[18]

Nadia Wardeh's thesis is titled "The Problematic of Turath in Contemporary Arab Thought: A Study of Adonis and Hasan Hanafi." Adonis believes that Turath should be deconstructed, while Hasan Hanafi holds the belief that Islamic revelation is authoritative and uncorrupted. Both ideologies contribute to a new dimension.[19]

A study by Kersten (2022) titled "Hermeneutics and Islamic Liberation Theologies: Hasan Hanafi and Hamid Dabashi" investigates whether dialogical and dialectical interactions based on a shared intellectual history can transfer culture or concepts. This study employs two contemporary Muslim intellectuals, Hasan Hanafi and Hamid Dabashi, to translate epistemological concerns into an "Islamic liberation theology" with a political agenda-ethic.[20]

Abdulaziz Al–Jaber (2022). *Ijmâ¿ and its Dilemmas in Hasan Hanafi's Thought*. This descriptive and critical study compares Hanafi's approach to ijma' with other usul al-fiqh works. Hanafi's knowledge of usul al-fiqh was deemed insufficient for rejuvenation. Additionally, Hanafi introduces new terminology in his discussions, but his "renewal" of fiqh remained primarily verbal and did not significantly assist jurists.[21] Yudian Wahyudin, in his work entitled "Hassan Hanafi on Salafism and Secularism," discusses the "Heritage and Reform" or "Islamic Left" project of Egyptian philosopher Hassan Hanafi (born in 1935). This project aims to reconcile Salafism and secularism, the two predominant ideologies in his country.[22]

In contrast to the aforementioned articles, which shed light on Indonesian philosophers positioning themselves in opposition to the Salafism and secularism

---

[18] Novi Hendri, "Religion Between Turats And Modernity; Reflections Of Applied Islamology By Mohammed Arkoun," *Journal of Positive School Psychology* Vol. 6, No. 8, 3922-3935 (2022).

[19] Nadia Wardeh, "Tbe Proble;Matic of Turatn in Contemporary Arab Tbougbt:A Study of Adonis and Hasan Ijanafi" (The Institute ofIslamic Studies McGill University, Montreal, Quebec, Canada, 2008), https://escholarship.mcgill.ca/concern/theses/73666887f.

[20] Carool Kersten, "Hermeneutics and Islamic Liberation Theologies: Hasan Hanafi and Hamid Dabashi," in *Philosophical Hermeneutics and Islamic Thought*, ed. Sylvain Camilleri and Selami Varlik (Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2022), 157–68, https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-92754-7_11.

[21] Abdulaziz Al–Jaber, "Ijmâ¿ and its Dilemmas in Hasan Hanafi's Thought," April 28, 2022, 115–36, https://doi.org/10.31430/QYZP8395.

[22] Ibrahim M. Abu-Rabi», ed., *The Blackwell Companion to Contemporary Islamic Thought*, Blackwell Companions to Religion (Malden, Mass: Blackwell Pub, 2006).

movements while advocating for the Wasatiyah Islamic Movement, it is important to note that the Wasatiyyah Movement in Indonesia has its roots in the Islamization of this region, which gained momentum in the 13th century. Today, Islam in Indonesia exhibits characteristics such as *tawasut* (moderation), *tawazun* (balance), *I'tidal* (fairness), *tasamuh* (tolerance), *islah* (reformist tendencies), *ta'awun* (cooperation), *shura* (consultation), *muwathanah* (love for the country), *musawa* (equality), and *qudwah* (an example to follow).[23]

Azyumardi Azra asserts that Wasatiyah Islam represents a moderate, inclusive, and tolerant interpretation of Islam. In the context of international Islamic studies, justly balanced Islamic thought is termed "wasathiyah." The term is derived from the Quranic phrase "ummatan wasathan" (Qur'an, 2:143), which refers to those who maintain a middle path without leaning excessively to the left or right, up or down. The Wasathiyah position aligns with the ideal, as suggested in a hadith attributed to the Prophet Muhammad (*khayr umur awshatuha*)[24]

In this context, various Muslim cultures and religious traditions must be understood within the framework of Wasatiyah Islam, promoting religious moderation. Indonesian cultures and traditions have harmoniously adapted to Islam, resulting in a unique blend of local customs and Islamic principles across the diverse regions of Java, Sumatra, Kalimantan, Sulawesi, and other Indonesian islands. [25] This pluralism and democratic practice of Islam in Indonesia is celebrated and recognized globally, with German Chancellor Angela Merkel commending it. In recognition of Indonesia's efforts to promote religious tolerance, the Appeal of Conscience Foundation (AFC) in New York awarded President Susilo Bambang Yudoyono (SBY) the "World Statesmen Award" on May 31, 2013. Indonesia, as the largest democratic and tolerant Islamic nation, continues to enjoy international trust.[26]

Wasatiyah Indonesian Islam interprets and aligns Islamic traditions with values such as moderation, balance, fairness, tolerance, reformist tendencies, cooperation, consultation, love for the country, equality, and setting an example. However, Indonesian religious moderation faces various challenges:

---

[23] Azyumardi Azra, *Relevansi Islam Wasathiyah, Dari Melindungi Kampus Hingga Mengaktualisasikan Kesalehan* (Jakarta: Kompas, 2020).

[24] Azra.

[25] Mujammil Qomar, *Moderasi Islam Indonesia, Wajah Keberagaman Progresif, Inklusif Dan Pluralis* (Yogyakarta: IRCiSoD, 2003), 203.

[26] Syaûq Hasyim, "State and Religion: Considering Indonesian Islam as Model of Democratisation for the Muslim World," *Liberal Institute*, 2013.

[27] Dewi Fortuna Anwar, "Foreign Policy, Islam and Democracy in Indonesia," *Journal of Indonesian Social Sciences and Humanities* 3, no. 1 (December 5, 2018): 37–54, https://doi.org/10.14203/jissh.v3i1.45.

Extremism and radicalism: Indonesia, known for its religious tolerance, has been challenged by extremist groups promoting radical and intolerant views. [27] Politicization of religion: Indonesian politicians often exploit religious issues. Politicization of religion: Indonesian politicians occasionally exploit religious issues for their benefit, potentially obscuring religious moderation and contributing to interfaith conflicts. [28] Inequality: Despite constitutional guarantees of religious freedom, religious minorities in Indonesia still encounter discrimination, which can hinder religious moderation promoting inclusivity and plurality. [29] Intercultural ignorance: The lack of intercultural education in Indonesia can lead to misperceptions, stereotypes, and prejudices that hamper religious tolerance, understanding, and respect. [30] Horizontal conflicts: Local interfaith conflicts, driven by beliefs, misunderstandings, social and political factors, can disrupt local religious moderation efforts. [31]

Methodology

The research method used in this study was a literature review. This method involved investigating and analyzing various literary sources relevant to the research topic, such as books, scholarly journals, articles, and other writings related to "Islam Wasatiyah" in Indonesia and the viewpoints of Mohammed Arkoun and Hasan Hanafi regarding this concept. In the literature review method, the researcher gathered data from existing literature and conducted a critical analysis of its content. The goal was to understand different perspectives, identify patterns, establish connections, and gain in-depth insights into the research topic without conducting field research or collecting primary data. In this study, the literature review method was employed to evaluate and compare the viewpoints of Mohammed Arkoun and Hasan Hanafi on "Islam Wasatiyah" in Indonesia. The researcher collected data from the works of these two Muslim scholars, as well as from other sources relevant to the topic. The findings from this analysis were then used to draw conclusions about their contributions to the development of "Islam Wasatiyah" in Indonesia and how their viewpoints could influence moderate and inclusive perspectives within the country.

[28] Ronald Lukens-Bull, "THE TRADITIONS OF PLURALISM, ACCOMMODATION, AND ANTI-RADICALISM IN THE PESANTREN COMMUNITY," *JOURNAL OF INDONESIAN ISLAM* 2, no. 1 (June 1, 2008): 1, https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2008.2.1.1-15.

[29] Greg Fealy and Ronit Ricci, eds., "1. Diversity and Its Discontents: An Overview of Minority–Majority Relations in Indonesia," in *Contentious Belonging* (ISEAS Publishing, 2019), 1–16, https://doi.org/10.1355/9789814843478-005.

[30] Jamaludin Hadi Kusuma and Sulistiyono Susilo, "Intercultural and Religious Sensitivity among Young Indonesian Interfaith Groups," *Religions* 11, no. 1 (January 2, 2020): 26, https://doi.org/10.3390/rel11010026.

[31] Rumadi Rumadi, "Islam and Minority in Indonesia: Muslim's Intolerant to the Heterodox Sects," *International Journal of Psychosocial Rehabilitation* 24, no. 4 (April 30, 2020): 8072–85, https://doi.org/10.37200/IJPR/V24I4/PR2020756.

Results and Discussion
The Project Of Muhammad Arkoun and Hasan Hanafi's Though

Muhammad Arkoun initiates his examination of Islam by delving into the Qur'an, the experiences of Medina, and the interplay of mythology and reason present in both. Furthermore, Islamic thought adheres to ancient ummah traditions. In addition, most Muslims focus their research on political and polemical issues within Islam, often neglecting historical and psychological aspects beyond politics and polemics. Moreover, the most recent theological faculties teach Ushul ad-Din and Ushul al-Fiqh through repetition without developing any classical textbooks. Finally, the transmission of Greek texts to Syriac and Arabic, and then from Arabic to Latin, is traceable in Islamic history, but the socio-cultural factors contributing to the success and failure of Islamic philosophy (150–450/768–1058) remain largely unexplored. [32]

Arkoun asserts that the Qur'an evolved into a written text (mushaf, Quranic text) within a closed corpus (canon), forming the foundation for various other works such as tafsir, theology, law, and translation. The Qur'ânic text, in his view, does not represent theological synthesis, exegesis, or legal texts. [33] Arkoun calls it "Islam above" and underscores the need to differentiate between Islam and the Qur'an. "Islam" signifies the historical emergence of a distinct phenomenon, constrained by time and space, which cannot be solely defined by a body of texts. Analytical strategies and epistemological caution are required in understanding this distinction. The connection between the two necessitates historical, sociological, and linguistic research, aspects that have often been overlooked [34]. Islam has been subject to misunderstanding on religious, social, political, anthropological, psychological, and cultural levels, requiring the development of "Applied Islamology" to address these misconceptions. [35]

Arkoun's publications aim to liberate Islamic thought from ignorance and closed-mindedness through historical and critical research. This approach involves critiquing Islamic reason using contemporary Western sciences. Arkoun's methodology extends beyond Islamic studies by analyzing the implicit content of classical texts through the lenses of history, sociology, anthropology, linguistics, and philosophy. [36]

---

[32] Johan Hendrik Meuleman, *Muhammad Arkoun, Nalar Islami Dan Nalar Modern: Berbagai Tantangan Dan Jalan Baru, Terj. Rahayu S. Hidayat,* (Jakarta: INIS, 1994), 47.

[33] Küng and Küng, *Islam*, 530.

[34] Mohammed Arkoun, "Islam, Europe, the West: Meanings-at-Stake and the Will-to Power," in *John Cooper, Ronald L. Nettler and Mohamed Mahmoud (Ed.)Slam and Modernity Muslim Intellectuals Respond/* (London, New York: I.B.Tauris, 1998).

[35] Mohammed Arkoun, *Studi Islam Di Perancis, Dalam Azim Nanji (Ed), Peta Studi Islam Orientalisme Dan Arah Baru Kajian Islam Di Barat, Terj. Muamirotun* (Yogyakarta: Fajar Pustaka Baru, 2003), 55.

[36] Johan Hendrik Meuleman, *Muhammad Arkoun, Nalar Islami Dan Nalar Modern: Berbagai Tantangan Dan Jalan Baru, Terj. Rahayu S. Hidayat,* 76.

Mohammed Arkoun's "project of criticizing Islamic reason" is grounded in modern history. His most significant work is "Pour de la raison islamique" (Towards a Critique of Islamic Reason), which was later renamed "Tarikhiyyat al-Fikr al-Arabi al-Islami" (The History of Islamic Arabic Thought). Despite Arkoun's numerous other works, Luthfi Assyaukany believes that this painting encapsulates his philosophy. Arkoun's book employs historicism, a method that reconstructs meaning by disregarding text-context relevance. "Islamic reasoning criticism" utilizes historicism to reinterpret classical texts, as Arkoun endeavors to unearth new religious meanings. [37]

Arkoun asserts that the Qur'an offers divine guidance and should be interpreted in alignment with the evolution of human civilization. Failure to reinterpret these texts in light of societal dynamics can lead to stagnation. Muhammad's thoughts, as conveyed in the Qur'an, provide divine solutions to the social and moral issues within the Arab world, particularly in Makkah.[38]

This line of thought remains anchored in tradition but has adapted to contemporary needs. Arkoun distinguishes between two traditions: the first, represented by tradition with a small "t," is a product of human history and culture, passed down through generations or derived from the interpretation of God's revelation in sacred texts. The second tradition is open to critical examination. Tradition with a big "T" refers to the transcendental, eternal, and unchanging tradition.[39]

In "Pour de la raison Islamique" (Towards a Critique of Islamic Reason), also known as "Tarikhiyyat al-Fikr al-Arabi al-Islami," Mohammed Arkoun utilizes three terms familiar to Muslim scholars to dissect the history of Arab-Islamic thought: "the thinkable" (le pensable), "the unthinkable" (l'impensé), and "the not yet thought" (le pas encore pensé). "The thinkable" pertains to topics already contemplated by Muslims, while "the unthinkable" represents practices unrelated to religion that have not been considered. [40]

A critical reexamination of thought history, free from ideological conflicts between theology and philosophy and unburdened by definitions of substance, essence, and the transcendent imposed by religions that sanctify truth, particularly the Christian view derived from Jewish tradition and Greek logos. Arkoun's critique reevaluates modernity as a philosophical process that seeks to provide retroactive explanations for the dominant material civilization, often imposed on cultures through physical and symbolic violence. Modern fundamentalism, often rejected for its association with "Western values," serves as a defense against aggressive modernity.[41]

---

[37] Luthfi Assyaukany, "Islam dalam Konteks Pemikiran Pasca-Moderne: Pendekatan Menuju Kritik Akal Islam," nomor 1, V (1994).

[38] Farid Esack, *Qur'an Liberation and Pluralism* (Oxford/ : New York: One Word, 1966), 76.

[39] Felsenthal and Agbaria, "How to Read the Quran in Religious Islamic Education."

[40] Johan Hendrik Meuleman, *Muhammad Arkoun, Nalar Islami Dan Nalar Modern: Berbagai Tantangan Dan Jalan Baru, Terj. Rahayu S. Hidayat,*.

[41] Arkoun, "Islam, Europe, the West: Meanings-at-Stake and the Will-to Power," 172.

Arkoun's criticism of Islamic reason shares similarities with Hasan Hanafi's concept of "turat" and "tajdid," where "turats" are inherited from dominant civilizations and manifest in various ways. As the old precedes the new, "tajdid" involves reinterpreting "turats" to meet contemporary demands. [42]

The "modernization," "critique," and "formation" of Arabic reason through "tajdid" are innovative concepts. Reason transcends nationalism; humans possess pure reason, whether active or autonomous, potential or action, natural or acquired. Reason is an uncultured spiritual potential that developed among Arabic-speaking Islam-Arabic people. In contrast, German, French, English, European, and Jewish reason evolved in Europe during the 19th century. Arab reasoning, promoted by moderate and secular nationalists in the West, conferred enduring characteristics and methods of exclusion upon the primitive reasoning that emerged in early anthropological science. [43]

Secular revolutions and new traditional monarchies have hindered reformist and modernist efforts to promote Islamic pluralism. Conservatism and intolerance have impeded the development of a pluralistic and representative civil society. Future Muslim societies must reconcile Islamic values with freedom and fairness. Progress demands a constructive dialogue between traditionalism and modernization. Modernist Muslim intellectuals must blend old and new ideas to establish a just and moral society. [44]

The Arab Spring uprisings have redefined political Islam, making it less susceptible to being pitted against the West. Hanafi compares "political Islam" to "the West" and delves into its complexities, using Egypt as a case study. [45]

Hasan Hanafi's uneasiness stems from the division of the Islamic world into Islam and Arabia, or Masyriq and Magrib. Muslim generations have embraced these two poles, with a preference for the rationalist-scientific-naturalistic Maghreb over the Sufistic-illuminative-agamist Masyriq. This model's characteristics have brought the Maghreb closer to the West and the Masyriq closer to itself. Dialogue between these extremes is necessary to address this situation. [46]

Hasan Hanafi and Mohammed Arkoun, both prominent Muslim philosophers, have differing views on religious matters. Their primary disagreements include: Critical

---

[42] Hasan Hanafi, *Turats Wa Tajdid* (Qohiroh: Hindawi, 2017), 15.

[43] Hasan Hanafi, *Studi Filsafat I/ : Pembacaan Atas Tradisi Islam Kontemporer, Terjemahan Miftah Faqih* (Yogyakarta: LKIS, 2015).

[44] Sohail H. Hashmi, ed., *Islamic Political Ethics: Civil Society, Pluralism, and Conflict*, The Ethikon Series in Comparative Ethics (Princeton, N.J: Princeton University Press, 2002).

[45] Hasan Hanafi, "The Future of Political Islam and the West: The Islamic Movement in the Arab World with a Focus on Egypt," *Religious Studies and Theology* 32, no. 1 (December 12, 2013): 83–94, https://doi.org/10.1558/rsth.v32i1.83.

[46] Hasan Hanafi and Abid Muhammad Abid Al- Jabiri, *Dialog Timur Dan Barat, Menuju Rekonstruksi Metodologis Politik Arab Yang Progresif Dan Egaliter, Translate Umar al Bukhori* (Yogyakarta: IRCiSoD, 2015), 37.

Approach: Hasan Hanafi favors Marxist and critical theory methods for analyzing religion, emphasizing religion's social and political context. Mohammed Arkoun also employs a critical approach but places emphasis on religion's historical and interpretive dimensions. Arkoun stresses the importance of contextualizing religious texts and understanding the history of religion. [47]

Hasan Hanafi advocates religious renewal and transformation in modern society and politics. He promotes the adaptation of religion to address current issues. [48]In contrast, Mohammed Arkoun stresses the importance of perceiving religion as a dynamic reality. To address religious issues, he underscores the significance of historical and cultural awareness. [49]

Philosophy: Hasan Hanafi prefers Western philosophy and integrates it with Islamic ideas. He applies critical thinking and philosophy to religious and philosophical concerns. [50] Mohammed Arkoun, on the other hand, has a solid Western philosophical education but leans towards hermeneutic techniques and scholarly study.

Geographical and Cultural Scope: Another distinguishing factor lies in their context. Mohammed Arkoun is better known in Europe and the West compared to Hasan Hanafi. This distinction shapes their perspectives and the concerns they address.

Despite their differing religious views, both Hasan Hanafi and Mohammed Arkoun have made significant contributions to modern Islamic philosophy. They both promote critical thinking, interfaith interaction, and contextualized religion. These differences enhance the diversity of Muslim thought and contribute to a better understanding and adaptation of Islam in changing times.

Relationship Between The Concepts Of Arkoun And Hasan Hanafi Towards Islamic Wasatihiyah In Indonesia

Globalization, dominated by Western culture, presents a threat to the younger generation in the form of declining Indonesian nationalism and the negative influence of Western culture. To safeguard the nation, urgent cultural and religious dialogues are required. [51]

---

[47] Ahmad, "Mapping Neo-Modern and Postmodern Qur'ânic Reformist Discourse in the Intellectual Legacy of Fazlur Rahman and Mohammed Arkoun."

[48] Fadlil M. Manshur, "Hasan Hanafi, New Theology and Cultural Revolution: An Analysis of Cultural Intensification," *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies* 77, no. 4 (February 12, 2021), https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v77i4.6190.

[49] Muhammad Azhar, "The Implication of Mohammed Arkoun's Political Ethics in the Practical Politics" 12, no. 4: (2018): 396–410.

[50] Hanafi, "The Future of Political Islam and the West: The Islamic Movement in the Arab World with a Focus on Egypt."

[51] Haidar Baqir, *Islam Tuhan, Islam Manusia, Agama Dan Spritualitas Di Zaman Kacau* (Jakarta: Mizan, 2018), 212.

Indonesians employ Wasatiyyah Islam to discuss religious moderation and tradition. Wasatiyyah (moderation) has far-reaching effects in practically all areas of Islamic concern. "Moderation" is a moral virtue that impacts individuals and communities. In the Qur'an, moderation is a part of the Muslim community's identity and vision, as it is in most major religions and civilizations. It is referred to as the "golden path" in Graeco-Judaic and Christian creeds, Chung Yung in Confucianism, and Wasatiyyah in Islam. Moderation fosters social peace and balance in families, communities, and all human relationships. Despite its evident benefits, moderation is often overlooked in personal behavior, social connections, environmental practices, religious practices, interstate affairs, and finance. Given Huntington's "clash of civilizations" theory and the terrorist attacks on September 11th, Wasatiyyah has gained renewed significance in our pluralistic society.[52]

Splinter groups in Islam generate discord in Indonesia's religiously conservative society. Simuh mentions offshoot organizations like the Ahmadiyya sect in India and Jamaah Islam in Java, which blend Khawari and Siya. [53]

Kuntowijoyo observes that Islamic rituals deeply influence popular culture ceremonies in Indonesia. [54] Haidar Baqir, in line with this, believes that cultures should interact and undergo cultural acculturation with other cultures to enrich their own culture, provided it includes elements of goodness and values of brotherhood and humanity. [55]

The introduction of the concept of Islamic Wasatiyyah into society does not obliterate the existing customary practices. These customs have established a cultural value system. According to Koentjaraningrat, cultural values represented by deeply rooted traditions in society are highly resistant to rapid influence or replacement by other cultures. Hence, a significant portion of the population considers cultural values as a guiding principle in their lives. [56] Nurcholish Majid suggests that if the Muslim community in Indonesia wishes to modernize without forsaking its cultural heritage, it should engage in a dialogue between Islamic values and their cultural values. [57]

Muslim intellectual Mohammed Arkoun shares several ideas with the concept of religious moderation. Key similarities include:

Critique of Religion: Both Arkoun and the concept of religious moderation advocate for the critical examination of religion. Arkoun believes that religion should be interpreted

---

[52] Mohammad Hasyim Kamali, *The Middle Path of Moderation In Islam: The Qur'anic Pronciple of Wasatiyyah* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2015), 1.

[53] Simuh Simuh, *Pergolakan Pemikiran Dalam Islam* (Yogyakarta: IRCISoD, 2019), 21.

[54] Kuntowijoyo Kuntowijoyo, *Paradigma Islam Interpretasi Untuk Aksi* (Jakarta: Mizan, 1999), 235.

[55] Baqir, *Islam Tuhan, Islam Manusia, Agama Dan Spritualitas Di Zaman Kacau*, 28.

[56] Koentjaraningrat, *Pengantar Ilmu Antropologi* (Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2009), 153.

[57] Nurcholis Majid, *Nurcholis Majid, Cendekiawan Dan Religiositas Masyarakat* (Jakarta: Paramadina, 1999), 134.

and understood critically, as it is a product of human history and culture. Similarly, religious moderation promotes a critical, contextualized, and tolerant interpretation of religious beliefs and behaviors. Both Arkoun and religious moderation emphasize the importance of contextualizing religious knowledge and teachings, adapting them to social, cultural, and scientific advances.

Respectful Discourse and Understanding: Arkoun and religious moderation also emphasize the importance of interfaith dialogue. They believe that productive discussions can improve religious understanding, tolerance, and conflict resolution. Both encourage appreciating others' ideas and ideals, even when they differ from one's own. Additionally, Arkoun and religious moderation support inclusive approaches to religion, opposing sectarianism and religious exclusivity. Arkoun believes that religion should communicate to all people, while religious moderation stresses treating everyone equally, regardless of their religion or belief.

In summary, Mohammed Arkoun's ideas and religious moderation share commonalities, such as a critical approach to religion, the importance of contextual knowledge, interfaith engagement, and an inclusive understanding of religious practices. Both promote a courteous, tolerant, and open understanding of the religious beliefs and practices of others.[58]

There are several features of modern Muslim philosopher and thinker Hasan Hanafi's ideas that align with the concept of religious moderation. The key parallels between Hasan Hanafi's philosophy and religious moderation include:

Contextualizing Religious Understanding: Hasan Hanafi emphasizes the value of comprehending religion within its historical, social, and cultural context, a principle shared with religious moderation. He contends that religion must be interpreted and understood in light of the contemporary conditions present at a given time and place, allowing for adaptation to societal change and scientific advancements.[59]

Interreligious Conversation: Both Hasan Hanafi and religious moderation support and encourage interreligious dialogue among various religious traditions. They believe that such dialogue is essential for fostering respect, tolerance, and peace among followers of different religions and for resolving tensions and conflicts.[60]

Rejecting Religious Fanaticism: Hasan Hanafi condemns religious fanaticism and views that perpetuate divisions between different religious communities. He advocates inclusivity and emphasizes the importance of valuing and acknowledging diverse opinions. This aligns with the principles of religious moderation, which reject fanaticism, intolerance, and prejudice against other religious groups.

---

[58] Hendri, "Religion Between Turats And Modernity; Reflections Of Applied Islamology By Mohammed Arkoun."

[59] Hasan Hanafi, *Turats Wa Tajdid*.

[60] Syah Wardi Dzul Fadli Sya'bana, "KAUM MODERNIS DI NUSANTARA: Jami'at Khair," *Islamijah: Journal of Islamic Social Sciences* 2, no. 3 (2021).

Emphasis on Reason and Rational Thought: Hasan Hanafi, like religious moderation, encourages the application of reason and rational thought to better understand religion. He recognizes the value of reasoned thinking and scientific inquiry. This emphasis on reason and an open-minded approach to knowledge is a shared aspect of both Hanafi's ideas and religious moderation.

In summary, Hasan Hanafi and religious moderation share the belief that religion is a contextual and complex phenomenon. They both promote open communication, inclusivity, and reasoned thought, aiming to advance a tolerant, open, and respectful view of religion that respects the values and beliefs of others.

In the context of multicultural Indonesia, religious moderation refers to a strategy that promotes acceptance, harmony, and interfaith communication. The following are some similarities between religious moderation in Indonesia and the ideas of Hasan Hanafi, Mohammed Arkoun, and the concept of religious moderation in general:

1. Contextual Understanding of Religion: Indonesia, a country rich in ethnic, cultural, and religious diversity, places significant value on understanding religion in the context of the nation. This approach calls for religious interpretations that respect the principle of "Unity in Diversity," where differences coexist harmoniously, and the Pancasila values that serve as the cornerstone of the state. This notion of context is akin to the methods employed by Arkoun and Hanafi, who emphasize the importance of considering social, cultural, and historical settings in the comprehension of religion.

2. Interreligious Communication: Indonesian religious moderation promotes communication and collaboration among followers of various religions. Initiatives such as interreligious discussions, interfaith dialogues, and interfaith forums seek to nurture tolerance, reduce conflicts, and foster interfaith harmony. This approach aligns with the strategy for interreligious dialogue advocated by Arkoun and Hanafi.

3. Acceptance of Religious Diversity: Indonesian religious moderation advocates a welcoming attitude toward followers of multiple religions and celebrates religious diversity. This entails acknowledging and showing respect for the many religious traditions in Indonesia. This concept is consistent with the viewpoints of Hanafi, Arkoun, and the broader concept of religious moderation, all of which reject religious exclusivity and promote diverse perspectives.

4. Social Relevance and Justice: Indonesia places a strong emphasis on the social relevance of religion and prioritizes the principles of justice, equality, and humanity. It promotes the use of religious principles to address societal issues, defend human rights, and advance shared prosperity. This approach is consistent with Arkoun and Hanafi's intention to utilize religion as a source of inspiration for positive social change.

In terms of contextual knowledge of religion, interfaith communication, acceptance of religious plurality, and social importance, Indonesian religious moderation is aligned with the views of Arkoun and Hanafi. By upholding the ideals of interfaith harmony in the multicultural context of Indonesia, religious moderation aims to create an inclusive, tolerant, and peaceful society.

Conclusion

In this study, we examined the ideas of Mohammed Arkoun and Hasan Hanafi in relation to Islam Wasatiyah in Indonesia. Our findings indicate that their ideas are highly relevant to the concept of Islam Wasatiyah, which represents religious moderation in Indonesia.

First, Arkoun and Hanafi's emphasis on the contextual comprehension of religion aligns with the view that Islam must be interpreted within the diverse social, cultural, and historical context of Indonesia. It is essential to understand religion in its local context and recognize its variations and uniqueness.

Secondly, Arkoun and Hanafi's emphasis on interfaith dialogue and inclusiveness is consistent with the values of Wasatiyah Islam. Wasatiyah Islam promotes interfaith harmony and values the diversity of religions in Indonesia through constructive dialogue and mutual respect.

Despite some disparities in their focus on specific issues, the findings of this study suggest that Arkoun and Hanafi's ideas can significantly contribute to the development of moderate and tolerant thinking in Indonesia.

Therefore, the conclusion of this study is that the ideas of Mohammed Arkoun and Hasan Hanafi are highly relevant to Wasatiyah Islam in Indonesia. Both emphasize contextual comprehension, interreligious dialogue, and inclusiveness, which support the values of religious moderation and interfaith harmony within Islam Wasatiyah. These findings can serve as a foundation for the development of strategies and policies that promote religious harmony in Indonesia.

References

Abdulaziz Al–Jaber. "Ijmâ¿ and its Dilemmas in Hasan Hanafi's Thought," April 28, 2022, 115–36. https://doi.org/10.31430/QYZP8395.

Abu-Rabi», Ibrahim M., ed. *The Blackwell Companion to Contemporary Islamic Thought*. Blackwell Companions to Religion. Malden, Mass: Blackwell Pub, 2006.

Ahmad, Humaira. "Mapping Neo-Modern and Postmodern Qur'ânic Reformist Discourse in the Intellectual Legacy of Fazlur Rahman and Mohammed Arkoun." *Religions* 14, no. 5 (May 1, 2023): 595. https://doi.org/10.3390/rel14050595.

Anwar, Dewi Fortuna. "Foreign Policy, Islam and Democracy in Indonesia." *Journal of Indonesian Social Sciences and Humanities* 3, no. 1 (December 5, 2018): 37–54. https://doi.org/10.14203/jissh.v3i1.45.

Arkoun, Mohammed. "Islam, Europe, the West: Meanings-at-Stake and the Will-to Power." In *John Cooper, Ronald L. Nettler and Mohamed Mahmoud (Ed.)Slam and Modernity Muslim Intellectuals Respond/*. London, New York: I.B.Tauris, 1998.

———. *Studi Islam Di Perancis, Dalam Azim Nanji (Ed), Peta Studi Islam Orientalisme Dan Arah Baru Kajian Islam Di Barat, Terj. Muamirotun*. Yogyakarta: Fajar Pustaka Baru, 2003.

Azhar, Muhammad. "The Implication of Mohammed Arkoun's Political Ethics in the Practical Politics" 12, no. 4: (2018): 396–410.

Azra, Azyumardi. *Relevansi Islam Wasathiyah, Dari Melindungi Kampus Hingga Mengaktualisasikan Kesalehan*. Jakarta: Kompas, 2020.

Baqir, Haidar. *Islam Tuhan, Islam Manusia, Agama Dan Spritualitas Di Zaman Kacau*. Jakarta: Mizan, 2018.

Cooper, Mohamed Mahmoud, Ronald L. Nettler, John. *Islam and Modernity_ Muslim Intellectuals Respond*. London: IB. Tauris & CO.Ltd, 2000.

Dzul Fadli Sya'bana, Syah Wardi. "KAUM MODERNIS DI NUSANTARA: Jami'at Khair." *Islamijah: Journal of Islamic Social Sciences* 2, no. 3 (2021).

Esposito, John L. *The Future of Islam*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2010.

Farid Esack. *Qur'an Liberation and Pluralism*. Oxford/ : New York: One Word, 1966.

Fazeli, Hamidreza. "A Critical Study of the Quran's Theory of Mythology (A Case Study on Mohammad Arkoun's Perspectives)," no. 71 (2019).

Fealy, Greg, and Ronit Ricci, eds. "1. Diversity and Its Discontents: An Overview of Minority–Majority Relations in Indonesia." In *Contentious Belonging*, 1–16. ISEAS Publishing, 2019. https://doi.org/10.1355/9789814843478-005.

Felsenthal, Iddo, and Ayman Agbaria. "How to Read the Quran in Religious Islamic Education: What Educators Can Learn from the Work of Mohammed Arkoun." *Religions* 14, no. 1 (January 16, 2023): 129. https://doi.org/10.3390/rel14010129.

H., G. F., and Faziur Rahman. "Islamic Methodology in History." *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 87, no. 2 (April 1967): 221. https://doi.org/10.2307/597503.

Haddad, Mohamed. "Postscript: When Islam Awakens: Problematizing the Idea of Reformation (Islah) by Mohamed Arkoun." In *Muslim Reformism - A Critical History: Is Islamic Religious Reform Possible?*, edited by Mohamed Haddad, 157–68. Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2020. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-36774-9_7.

Hadi Kusuma, Jamaludin, and Sulistiyono Susilo. "Intercultural and Religious Sensitivity among Young Indonesian Interfaith Groups." *Religions* 11, no. 1 (January 2, 2020): 26. https://doi.org/10.3390/rel11010026.

Hanafi, Hasan. "The Future of Political Islam and the West: The Islamic Movement in the Arab World with a Focus on Egypt." *Religious Studies and Theology* 32, no. 1 (December 12, 2013): 83–94. https://doi.org/10.1558/rsth.v32i1.83.

Hanafi, Hasan, and Abid Muhammad Abid Al- Jabiri. *Dialog Timur Dan Barat, Menuju Rekonstruksi Metodologis Politik Arab Yang Progresif Dan Egaliter, Translate Umar al Bukhori*. Yogyakarta: IRCiSoD, 2015.

Hasan Hanafi. *Studi Filsafat I/ : Pembacaan Atas Tradisi Islam Kontemporer, Terjemahan Miftah Faqih*. Yogyakarta: LKIS, 2015.

———. *Turas Wa Tajdid (Qohiroh: An-Nasr Muasasah Hindawi, 2017), 15*. Qohiroh: An-Nasr Muasasah Hindawi, 2017.

———. *Turats Wa Tajdid*. Qohiroh: Hindawi, 2017.

Hashmi, Sohail H., ed. *Islamic Political Ethics: Civil Society, Pluralism, and Conflict*. The Ethikon Series in Comparative Ethics. Princeton, N.J: Princeton University Press, 2002.

Hasyim, Syaûq. "State and Religion: Considering Indonesian Islam as Model of Democratisation for the Muslim World." *Liberal Institute*, 2013.

Hendri, Novi. "Religion Between Turats And Modernity; Reflections Of Applied Islamology By Mohammed Arkoun." *Journal of Positive School Psychology* Vol. 6, No. 8, 3922-3935 (2022).

Hourani, Albert. *Arabic Thought in the Liberal Age 1798–1939. Arabic Thought in the Liberal Age 1798–1939*. Cambridge: Cambridge Universty Press, 1983.

Johan Hendrik Meuleman. *Muhammad Arkoun, Nalar Islami Dan Nalar Modern: Berbagai Tantangan Dan Jalan Baru, Terj. Rahayu S. Hidayat,*. Jakarta: INIS, 1994.

Kamali, Mohammad Hasyim. *The Middle Path of Moderation In Islam: The Qur'anic Pronciple of Wasatiyyah*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2015.

Kersten, Carool. "Hermeneutics and Islamic Liberation Theologies: Hasan Hanafi and Hamid Dabashi." In *Philosophical Hermeneutics and Islamic Thought*, edited by Sylvain Camilleri and Selami Varlik, 157–68. Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2022. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-92754-7_11.

Koentjaraningrat. *Pengantar Ilmu Antropologi*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2009.

Küng, Hans, and Hans Küng. *Islam: Past, Present and Future*. Oxford: Oneworld, 2007.

Kuntowijoyo, Kuntowijoyo. *Paradigma Islam Interpretasi Untuk Aksi*. Jakarta: Mizan, 1999.

Lee, Robert Deemer. *Overcoming Tradition and Modernity: The Search for Islamic Authenticity*. Boulder, Colo: Westview Press, 1997.

Lukens-Bull, Ronald. "THE TRADITIONS OF PLURALISM, ACCOMMODATION, AND ANTI-RADICALISM IN THE PESANTREN COMMUNITY." *JOURNAL OF INDONESIAN ISLAM* 2, no. 1 (June 1, 2008): 1. https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2008.2.1.1-15.

Luthfi Assyaukany. "Islam dalam Konteks Pemikiran Pasca-Moderne: Pendekatan Menuju Kritik Akal Islam," nomor 1, V (1994).

Majid, Nurcholis. *Nurcholis Majid, Cendekiawan Dan Religiositas Masyarakat*. Jakarta: Paramadina, 1999.

Manshur, Fadlil M. "Hasan Hanafi, New Theology and Cultural Revolution: An Analysis of Cultural Intensification." *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies* 77, no. 4 (February 12, 2021). https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v77i4.6190.

Matem M. Al-Janabi. "The Ideology of Islamic Cultural Reformation (by the Example of Hassan Hanafi)." *Asian and Africa Today*, 2020.

Mohammed Arkoun. "Present–Day Islam Between Its Tradition and Globalization." In *Farhad Daftary (Ed.) Intellectual Traditions in Islam*. New York/ : L. B. Tauris, 2000: L. B. Tauris, 2000.

Nadia Wardeh. "Tbe Proble;Matic of Turatn in Contemporary Arab Tbougbt:A Study of Adonis and Hasan Ijanafi." The Institute ofIslamic Studies McGill University, Montreal, Quebec, Canada, 2008. https://escholarship.mcgill.ca/concern/theses/73666887f.

Qomar, Mujammil. *Moderasi Islam Indonesia, Wajah Keberagaman Progresif, Inklusif Dan Pluralis*. Yogyakarta: IRCiSoD, 2003.

Roy, Olivier. *The Failure of Political Islam*. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 1994.

Rumadi, Rumadi. "Islam and Minority in Indonesia: Muslim's Intolerant to the Heterodox Sects." *International Journal of Psychosocial Rehabilitation* 24, no. 4 (April 30, 2020): 8072–85. https://doi.org/10.37200/IJPR/V24I4/PR2020756.

Shahrur, Muhammad. *Al-Kitab Wa Al-Qur'an*. Suriah: Ahaly Li Tauzi', 1990.

Simuh, Simuh. *Pergolakan Pemikiran Dalam Islam*. Yogyakarta: IRCISoD, 2019.

Zbir, Abdallah. "Situating Mohammed Arkoun: A Tribute to a Passionate Critic." *International Journal of Linguistics, Literature and Translation* 4, no. 1 (January 30, 2021): 101–8. https://doi.org/10.32996/ijllt.2021.4.1.11.